



2021 Census Advisory Group Meeting CAGW 14 June 2017

Minutes of meeting held on 14 June 2017, at the Welsh Assembly Government Building.

Attendees:

ONS

Neil Townsend	Head of 2021 Census stakeholder engagement
Shaun Garvey	Census Transformation Programme,(CTP) Deputy Director
Becky Tinsley	Beyond 2021 Research and Design - Video link
[REDACTED]	CTP, Outputs - Video link
[REDACTED]	CTP, Questionnaire Design
[REDACTED]	CTP, Questionnaire Design
[REDACTED] (Secretariat)	2021 Census stakeholder engagement and communications

CAGW

[REDACTED]	[REDACTED] Welsh Government
[REDACTED]	Local Government Data Unit
[REDACTED]	Caerphilly County Borough Council
[REDACTED]	City & County of Swansea
[REDACTED]	Cytun (Churches Together in Wales)
[REDACTED]	Public Health Wales Observatory

Apologies: [REDACTED] – Public Health Wales Observatory
[REDACTED] – Welsh Government

1. Welcome, introductions and previous minutes

- 1.1 [REDACTED] welcomed members to the Census Advisory Group meeting and members of the group introduced themselves. The minutes and actions from the previous meeting in December 2016 were discussed and agreed. Four Actions were carried forward.
- 1.2 Regarding the action to review the membership of this group, [REDACTED] reported that there had been a lot of interest in the advisory group at the Third Sector User Panel meeting, and that he would contact their members to ask if any would like to join the advisory group.

ACTION: [REDACTED] to ask members of Third Sector User Panel if they would like to join the census advisory group for Wales

ACTION: [REDACTED] will also consider which academics may like to join

ACTION: [REDACTED] will contact James Tucker to gauge interest in holding a session on the census at the Royal Statistical Society

- 1.3 Regarding [REDACTED] action to provide information on population estimate discrepancies in an LSOA in Rhyl, [REDACTED] reported that a paper on the subject had been published, and he would send copies to Neil Townsend and Becky Tinsley to forward on to interested parties

ACTION: [REDACTED] to send paper to BT and NT for forwarding to interested parties

- 1.4 Questions were asked about future testing. SG said that a Testing Plan is being developed and could be shared

ACTION: CAG Secretary to send Testing Plan to group

2. AG(17)01 – 2021 Census Highlight Report (summer 2017)

- 2.1 Neil Townsend (NT) introduced the CTP Highlight Report. Questions were asked about the address register. He has spoken with Alistair Calder who is leading this work, and he advised that road shows would be held around the country later in the year.
- 2.2 He added that more emphasis was being placed on developing the classification for communal establishments, and that the approach was being simplified. He offered to find out more from ONS geography and report back to the group.

ACTION: NT to report on Communal Establishment simplification

- 2.3 A comment was made about the difficulties in finding out about new student halls of residence, as many were being built around the country, so it was difficult to keep track of them. It was also difficult finding students living in residential areas.
- 2.4 Shaun Garvey (SG) explained that we are building a network of contacts to enable us to collect the relevant information from the universities and colleges. He said it is important to work up from the local level to build up the information.
- 2.5 [REDACTED] asked [REDACTED] whether her organisation could help ONS in collecting religious communal establishment information.

ACTION: [REDACTED] will provide ONS with a list of religious communal establishments in Wales

- 2.6 NT outlined the work taking place on Output Areas – to investigate whether changes need to be made before the next census. [REDACTED] commented that it would be useful to have more frequent geography updates, particularly when changes were being made.

ACTION: NT to discuss having a geography update at the next meeting

- 2.7 NT spoke about a new operations group being set up which will have a narrower focus than the CAG meetings – concentrating more on large cities, rural areas and local authority issues and with more of an operational slant. We will be writing to various local authorities for suggestions for membership.

ACTION: NT to write to LA's. [REDACTED] will also progress this through his forums

3. Welsh Government Update

- 3.1 [REDACTED] gave the Welsh Government update, explaining the work that has been continuing, helping ONS get in touch with their users. NT had attended the Welsh Statistical Liaison Committee. Work has also been continuing with the census topic groups.
- 3.2 The Admin Data Research Network (funded by the ESRC) has a project to link census data with the National Survey for Wales, to look at the use of the Welsh Language. A statistical article and possible output are planned. [REDACTED] will report back at the next meeting.

ACTION: [REDACTED] to report on the use of the Welsh Language at the next meeting

- 3.3 He reported that the Welsh Government is waiting for approval on a bid to link 2011 census data with the English Patient Register – to investigate how many Welsh speakers are living in England. He explained that approximately 2000 Welsh speakers leave Wales each year. [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] are leading on this project.

4. Update on the Admin Data Census Project

- 4.1 Becky Tinsley (BT) reported that the Annual Assessment of ONS's progress towards an Administrative Data Census post-2021, would be published on 20 June 2017. She presented slides outlining the main findings so far (slides attached to these minutes). She commented that positive changes in the assessment were due to the effects of the passing of the Digital Economy Act, and said that we were still at the start of the journey but we expect to get where we need to by 2023.
- 4.2 She mentioned the testing plan for 2020, which will be a full scale test of the population. Various questions were asked: will separate surveys be needed or integrated household surveys? What admin data is available? Becky explained that more activity data would be needed for population characteristics.

- 4.3 She explained the differences between the research output estimates on housing and the official census household definitions, and advised that on 13 July an event will be held at the Royal Statistical Society in London, to further explain the housing topic.

ACTION: CAG Secretary to send link to event on 13 July to CAG members

- 4.4 CAG members commented that because of the difference in definitions, there would be a mismatch in results. One member wondered which would be the most useful – more regular data or to stay with the accepted definitions?
- 4.5 BT said that the early results comparing the 2011 Census data with the 2015 data showed 6 – 7 per cent under-coverage for Wales, and commented that one cause could be the problems with Welsh language addresses not connecting up with address-base information. She added that under-coverage in Gwynedd was probably due to lack of student information. She explained that Higher Education Statistics Authority (HESA) data and the Welsh Schools Census (which form part of the datasets used for the coverage) doesn't contain address information.

- 4.6 [REDACTED] asked BT about the 4 per cent under-count in Caerphilly. BT said she would investigate this and respond to [REDACTED].

ACTION: BT to investigate the under-count in Caerphilly and advise [REDACTED]

5. AG(17)02 Outputs and Dissemination Update

- 5.1 [REDACTED] introduced the Outputs and Dissemination Update. He explained that ONS are looking to develop a fast online table-building tool. It will be most important to manage disclosure control effectively. The main approach is to use targeted record swapping. ONS is currently working on developing a test dataset.
- 5.2 He explained that there would be a trade-off in accessing the data faster and in having more flexibility in creating tables, in that there would be differences in the totals produced. A user event was held on 7 April and most participants were relatively content with these differences. The next stage will be to obtain authorisation to progress this work, and to continue to make the rules around disclosure control more rigorous. There will be more user engagement in the coming year, and a high level consultation in early 2018.
- 5.3 A general discussion arose about the potential for producing multivariate tables online, and that more flexibility for users would be very beneficial. [REDACTED] commented that it would be useful if ONS could produce some multivariate tables for comparison purposes.

6. AG(17)03 – Update on Questionnaire Development

- 6.1 [REDACTED] and [REDACTED] from the Questionnaire and Question Design team in the Census Transformation Programme gave some background to the paper, and asked for feedback on ONS' proposed direction of travel for the topics outlined in the paper:
- Number of rooms and bedrooms – ONS are proposing to exclude the number of rooms and number of bedrooms questions

- Volunteering – cognitive testing on the volunteering question has shown it is very difficult to design a question which is easily understood by the general public. The current thinking is not to include a new question on this topic
- Veterans – this has been successfully tested and the outcome has been positive. The British Legion has been campaigning for its inclusion – one of the reasons being that the Ministry of Defence don't have data on veterans who served in the armed forces before 1970. ONS and MOD are also looking at an admin data based approach
- Sex and gender identity – both of the questions on these topics have been tested for public acceptability. Testing is continuing

ACTION: [REDACTED] to advise [REDACTED] on the sex and gender definitions

- Marriage – the current opinion is that there is not a strong enough user need to change the marriage question
- Ethnicity – various designs of the ethnicity question are being explored. [REDACTED] commented that it will be very important to get the online version of the question right as well as the paper questionnaire in order to capture the correct data. [REDACTED] asked for the ethnicity definitions

ACTION: [REDACTED] to advise [REDACTED] of the ethnicity definitions

- Language – contracts are being procured at the moment to enable cognitive testing regarding the English/Welsh tick boxes for the "Main language" question.

7. Initial Results from the 2017 Census Test

7.1 Shaun Garvey (SG) opened the session by giving background to the reasons for holding the test; operational issues during the test and preliminary findings from the test. He said that there were 36 different topics to be tested within the overall test, one of which was to measure the response rate if a sexual identity question was asked.

7.2 He explained there were 3 components to the test:

1. 100,000 households in 7 local authorities: Powys (part), Blackpool, Barnsley, Sheffield, South Somerset, West Dorset and Southwark
2. 100,000 households selected randomly within England and Wales
3. 3,000 communal establishments

An additional 8,000 households on the Isle of Wight were asked to take part to test the take up of assisted digital – offers of assistance in completing the online questionnaire. This was taken up in libraries and community centres.

7.3 There were 350 field staff dealing with the follow up which began on 13 April and ended on 10 May.

7.4 SG commented that we had received good support from the local authorities, singling out Powys as being particularly helpful.

- 7.5 The overall return rate as at the meeting (before the final results are known) was 34%, made up of 40% for Component 1 (89% online and 11% on paper); 29% for Component 2 (30% online and 70% on paper) and 13% for Component 3 (of which 89% were online). These responses have enabled us to identify the characteristics of the responders, which will be essential for the planning of the next census.
- 7.6 There were over 20,000 calls made to the public helpline during the test, an unprecedented amount considering that in the 2007 Test there were 4500 calls. These were dealt with in-house. However, a procurement exercise for a call centre contract for the census proper will be starting in the next few weeks.
- 7.7 The electronic solution for managing the field force work proved extremely useful, and enabled better targeting of where the resource in the field was needed. ONS is investigating the Australia/New Zealand electronic solution.
- 7.8 ■ said he would be interested in finding out why the Welsh Language responses were so low (in the tens, rather than the hundreds).

ACTION: SG to update ■ after investigation into why the amount of responses in Welsh was so low

- 7.9 In a breakdown of the ways the questionnaires were completed online, the use of personal computers was the most popular, while the use of hand-held devices varied.
- 7.10 The analysis of the 2017 Test will continue over the summer months, with a report published in the autumn.
- 7.11 Details of the evaluation were given. ■ would like more information when available.

ACTION: Note on the evaluation to be sent to CAG members

- 7.12 It was suggested that a speaker from ONS attend a meeting between of the Welsh Government Ministerial Digital and Data Group in September to discuss digital across government.

ACTION: NT to investigate getting a speaker from ONS to attend a meeting of the Welsh Government Ministerial Digital and Data Group.

8. Any Other Business

- 8.1 NT asked whether anyone from the Welsh Government would like to volunteer for a secondment to test the Welsh language question. He will confirm the details with ■

ACTION: NT to send details of secondment to ONS to ■

9. Date of next meeting: December 2017

Action Number	Owner	Detail
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 03	██████████	████ will contact James Tucker to gauge interest in holding a session on the census at the Royal Statistical Society (awaiting response)
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 06	██████████	████ will provide ONS with a list of religious communal establishments in Wales. Ongoing
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 11	Becky Tinsley	BT to investigate the under-count in Caerphilly and advise █████. Ongoing
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 12	██████████	████ to advise █████ on the sex and gender definitions. Ongoing
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 14	Shaun Garvey	SG to update █████ after investigation into why the amount of responses in Welsh was so low Ongoing
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 16	Neil Townsend	NT to investigate getting a speaker from ONS to attend a meeting of the Welsh Government Ministerial Digital and Data Group. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 17	Neil Townsend	NT to send details of secondment to ONS to █████. Completed. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 01	██████████	████ to ask members of Third Sector User Panel if they would like to join the census advisory group for Wales. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 02	██████████	████ will also consider which academics may like to join the census advisory group for Wales. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 04	██████████	████ to send paper to BT and NT to forward to interested parties. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 07	Neil Townsend	NT to discuss having a geography update at the next meeting using the video-conferencing facility Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 08	Neil Townsend	NT to write to LA's. █████ will also progress this through his forums. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 09	██████████	████ to report on the use of the Welsh Language at the next meeting. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 10	CAG Sec	CAG Secretary to send link of 13 July event to CAG members. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 13	██████████	████ to advise █████ of the ethnicity definitions. Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 15	CAG Sec	Note of the evaluation to be sent

		to [REDACTED] and CAG members. Ongoing – evaluation report has not yet been published. Closed – report will be published on 13 December when it will be sent to all CAG members Closed
CAG-W 01.12.16 AP 06	[REDACTED], Ben Humberstone and Neil Townsend	[REDACTED], Ben Humberstone (BH) and Neil Townsend (NT) to discuss membership - Ongoing – Members of Welsh Third Sector Liaison Panel were invited or had suggestions for memberships – none have been received as yet (Aug 2017) Closed
CAG-W 01.12.16 AP 15	[REDACTED]	[REDACTED] to provide information on population estimate discrepancies in an LSOA in Rhyl - Ongoing - [REDACTED] will send copies of paper to Becky and Neil Townsend to send on to interested parties. Closed
CAG-W 01.12.16 AP 16	Matt Fido	[REDACTED] will ask if Test Plan can be shared at the next CAG meeting Ongoing This has been passed to Matt Fido who has taken over [REDACTED] role (awaiting response). Closed as results of test have now been published
CAG-W 01.12.16 AP 18	Becky Tinsley	BT to send map of income in Wales - Closed
CAG W 14.06.17 AP 05	Neil Townsend	NT to report on Communal Establishment simplification. Closed – Agenda item will be arranged for summer CAGs. Closed